Grading Rubric:

Criteria:	Proficient 3 points	Competent 2 points	Novice 0-1 point
Clinical question and PICO	Listed clinic question at top of report; Correctly identified the P, I, C, and O	Did not state clinical question at top of report OR incorrectly identified either the P, I, C, or O	Did not state clinical question at top of report OR incorrectly identified 2 or more of the P, I, C, and O
Articles	Listed titles of articles; Identified "type" of research; Accurately stated "level of evidence"	Listed titles of articles; 1 error in listing "type" or "level of evidence" with one of the articles	Did not listed title of one of the articles OR 2 or more errors in listing "type" or "level of evidence" with one or more of the articles
Validity and Reliability	Clearly described issues of validity and reliability for each research article; backed up statements by referring to information in articles	Not clear in describing issues of validity and reliability for one of the articles OR needed more detail in backing up statements in one of the articles	Not clear in describing issues of validity and reliability for two or more of the articles OR needed more detail in backing up statements in one or more of the articles
Significance	Discussed in detail statistical and clinical significance for all three articles	Discussed in detail statistical and clinical significance for two of the articles; one article needed more detail in regards to significance	Discussed in detail statistical and clinical significance for one of the articles; needed more detail in regards to significance for other two articles
Results	Clearly described results from each article	Needed more clear and detailed descriptions of results for one of the articles	Needed more clear and detailed descriptions of results for two or all three articles
Bias	Identified and explained types of potential bias for all three articles	Needed more clear explanation of types of bias for one of the articles	Needed more clear explanation of types of bias for two or all three articles
Patient question	Discussed if subjects in study were representative of the patient; explained if	For one of the articles: Did not describe how well subjects in study represented patient OR	For one or more of the articles: Did not describe how well subjects in study

	the treatment was feasible in clinic setting; Shared opinion on how well the evidence answer the clinical question	did not explain if treatment is feasible OR did not share opinion on how well evidence answered the clinical question	represented patient AND/OR did not explain if treatment is feasible AND/OR did not share opinion on how well evidence answered the clinical question
Conclusion	Concluded report by combining the information gleaned from critically analyzing all 3 articles; Stated how you would answer the patient for the question they posed to you; no writing errors.	Did not clearly combine information summarized from all 3 articles OR did not clearly state how you would answer the patient question OR 2 or more writing errors	Did not clearly combine information summarized from all 3 articles AND/OR did not clearly state how you would answer the patient question AND/OR 2 or more writing errors